SMALL LEGACY CITIES, EQUITY, AND A CHANGING ECONOMY
IN THE NEWS

The Boston Globe
Wealth gap limits equality of education
High-income families spend 7 times more each year on learning expenses
By Megan Woolhouse | GLOBE STAFF | JULY 05, 2013

Forbes
CBO Details Growing U.S. Income Inequality
WASHINGTON 12/09/2013 3:31PM | 20,560 views
High-income families have always lived in the U.S., but now these families are more likely to have more income, up from 40% in 2000.

The New York Times
In Climbing Income Ladder, Location Matters
A study finds the odds of rising to another income level are notably low in certain cities, like Atlanta and Charlotte, and much higher in New York and Boston.
“I believe this is the defining challenge of our time: Making sure our economy works for every working American.”

- President Obama, December 4th, 2013
“Today everything comes under the laws of competition and the survival of the fittest... As a consequence, masses of people find themselves excluded and marginalized...”

- Pope Francis, November 24, 2013
INEQUITY, DISPARITY, STRATIFICATION

THE CONVERSATION

Equal Opportunity, Our National Myth

Inequality Is Holding Back the Recovery

How Inequality Hollows Out the Soul

Income Gap Fraying US Social Fabric

Income Inequality Begins to Hit Business in the Pocketbook

Inequality Undermines Democracy

Health, Wealth and Inequality

Education

Stagnant Wages

Social Mobility

Inequity

Poverty

Wealth Gap
THE CONVERSATION

IN POST-INDUSTRIAL LEGACY CITIES

HISTORIC WATER FILTRATION PLANT, WILMINGTON

VACANT INDUSTRIAL BUILDING, PHILADELPHIA

Source: Thomson Kao
THE CONVERSATION

IN POST-INDUSTRIAL LEGACY CITIES

OVER-THE-RHINE, CINCINNATI

NORTHERN LIBERTIES, PHILADELPHIA

Source: Randy A. Simes for UrbanCincy.com; Thomson Kao
PROJECT BACKGROUND
EQUITY IN DEVELOPMENT
METHODOLOGY
CASE STUDIES
SYNTHESIS
IN PHILADELPHIA’S SHADOW

BY ALAN MALLACH

IN PHILADELPHIA’S SHADOW:
SMALL CITIES IN THE THIRD FEDERAL RESERVE DISTRICT

A Special Report by the Community Development
Studies and Education Department

Source: Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia
REBOUNDING CITIES

Source: Ellie Devyatkin, Ryan Debold, Kevin Hunter
EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

EQUITY
EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

EQUITY
WHAT IS EQUITY?
WHAT IS EQUITY?

DEFINING EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT
EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT refers to a set of processes and outcomes.
EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT refers to a set of processes and outcomes that advances opportunities, choices, and access for all citizens,
EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT refers to a set of processes and outcomes that advances opportunities, choices, and access for all citizens, with particular regard for disadvantaged groups and individuals.
WHAT IS EQUITY?

COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT
WHAT IS EQUITY?

COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

Decent, affordable HOUSING
WHAT IS EQUITY?

COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

- Decent, affordable **HOUSING**
- High quality, culturally appropriate **EDUCATION**
WHAT IS EQUITY?

COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

- Decent, affordable **HOUSING**
- High quality, culturally appropriate **EDUCATION**
- Accessible **HEALTH** care, healthy foods, recreational opportunities, and a healthy environment
WHAT IS EQUITY?

COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

- Decent, affordable **HOUSING**
- High quality, culturally appropriate **EDUCATION**
- Accessible **HEALTH** care, healthy foods, recreational opportunities, and a healthy environment
- Diverse and practical **TRANSPORTATION** options
WHAT IS EQUITY?

COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

- Decent, affordable **HOUSING**
- High quality, culturally appropriate **EDUCATION**
- Accessible **HEALTH** care, healthy foods, recreational opportunities, and a healthy environment
- Diverse and practical **TRANSPORTATION** options
- Safe, living-wage **EMPLOYMENT**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COMPONENTS OF EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Decent, affordable <strong>HOUSING</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High quality, culturally appropriate <strong>EDUCATION</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessible <strong>HEALTH</strong> care, healthy foods, recreational opportunities, and a healthy environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diverse and practical <strong>TRANSPORTATION</strong> options</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe, living-wage <strong>EMPLOYMENT</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaningful <strong>PARTICIPATION</strong> in political and civic life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WHAT IS EQUITY?
WHY EQUITY?
EQUITY AS A PREREQUISITE FOR DEMOCRACY

“...the promise of equal access to the discourses necessary for democratic participation rings hollow.”

- The American Library Association
WHY EQUITY?

UNEVEN INCOME GAINS

Source: Adapted from The Distribution of Household Income and Federal Taxes, 2010 (Congressional Budget Office); Bureau of Economic Analysis
HEALTH DISPARITY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All U.S.</td>
<td>78.7</td>
<td>66.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>78.9</td>
<td>67.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>75.1</td>
<td>61.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CDC National Center for Health Statistics; CDC Health Disparities and Inequalities Report - United States, 2013
WHY EQUITY?

UNEQUAL EDUCATION

![Graph showing the test score difference (standard deviations) between cohort birth years from 1940 to 2000.](graph.png)

- **90/10 Income Gap (Math)**
- **Black-White Gap (Math)**

Source: Adapted from The Widening Academic Achievement Gap Between the Rich and the Poor: New Evidence and Possible Explanations, S. Reardon, 2011
WHY EQUITY?

UNEQUAL EDUCATION

Test Score Difference (Standard Deviations)

Cohort Birth Year

90/10 Income Gap (Math)
90/10 Income Gap (Reading)
Black-White Gap (Math)
Black-White Gap (Reading)

Source: Adapted from The Widening Academic Achievement Gap Between the Rich and the Poor: New Evidence and Possible Explanations, S. Reardon, 2011
WHY EQUITY?

SPATIAL SEGREGATION

Source: Adapted from K. Bischoff and S. Reardon, Residential Segregation by Income, 1970-2009
WHY EQUITY?

FAIRNESS & MORAL OBLIGATION

Source: Wikimedia Commons
EQUITABLE OUTCOMES
METHODOLOGY

+1 Remaining Building

Site Description/Characteristics
- 47 acres
- Near rail yard (active?)
- $29 million in public subsidy went to remediate the site

Partners
- Lancaster EDC
- Franklin & Marshall College
- Lancaster General Hospital
- Armstrong World Industries
METHODOLOGY

A FRAMEWORK FOR EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

Source: Delaware Public Media WDDE
METHODOLOGY

A FRAMEWORK FOR EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

RIVERFRONT  ARTS-BASED  CASINO

Source: Kevin Hunter, Meg Dahlgren, Ryan Debold
PHASE I: ASSESSING EQUITY

ASSESSING EQUITY

BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

MONITOR & REASSESS
PHASE II: BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

ASSESSING EQUITY

MONITOR & REASSESS
METHODOLOGY

PHASE III: MONITORING & RE-ASSESSING

ASSESSING EQUITY

BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

MONITOR & REASSESS
METHODOLOGY

A FRAMEWORK FOR EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

ASSESSING EQUITY

BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

MONITOR & REASSESS
METHODOLOGY

PHASE I: ASSESSING EQUITY

PRECEDENT PLANS
LITERATURE REVIEW
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

EXISTING CONDITIONS
INDICATORS
SYNTHESIS

STATE OF EQUITY
HYPOTHESIZE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY
COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

MONITOR & REASSESS
IDENTIFY DESIRED EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

METHODOLOGY

SHORT TERM

ENGAGE

STAKEHOLDERS

REFINE OUTCOMES

LONG TERM

MONITOR &

RE-ASSESS

RE-EVALUATE

STATE OF EQUITY &

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

EXISTING CONDITIONS

SYNTHESIS

STATE OF EQUITY

HYPOTHESIZE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY

COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PRECEDENT PLANS

LITERATURE REVIEW

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

INDICATORS

INDICATORS

INDICATORS
METHODOLOGY

IDENTIFY DESIRED EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

PRECEDENT PLANS
LITERATURE REVIEW
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

INDICATORS
SYNTHESIS

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

EQUITY

COMPONENTS

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
LITERATURE REVIEW
PRECEDENT PLANS

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES
METHODOLOGY

PHASE II: BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

ASSESSING EQUITY

MONITOR & REASSESS

PRIORITIZE

EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS

PROPOSE

REFINE

EQUITABLE CONDITIONS

PROPOSE

REFINE

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PROPOSE

REFINE

IMPLEMENT INTERVENTIONS

AFFECT CONDITIONS

PROGRESS TOWARDS OUTCOMES
METHODOLOGY

SELECT CONDITIONS LEADING TO OUTCOMES

EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS

PROPOSE

REFINE

EQUITABLE CONDITIONS

PROPOSE

REFINE

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PRIORITIZE

IMPLEMENT

AFFECT

PROGRESS TOWARDS

OUTCOMES
METHODOLOGY

SELECT INTERVENTIONS LEADING TO CONDITIONS

EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS

PROPOSE

REFINE

EQUITABLE CONDITIONS

PROPOSE

REFINE

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PRIORITIZE

IMPLEMENT

AFFECT

PROGRESS TOWARDS

INTERVENTIONS

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES
METHODOLOGY

SELECT CONDITIONS LEADING TO OUTCOMES

A healthy, active city
METHODOLOGY

SELECT CONDITIONS LEADING TO OUTCOMES

EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS → PROPOSE → EQUITABLE CONDITIONS → PROPOSE → EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

Ensure access to affordable healthcare

A healthy, active city
METHODOLOGY

SELECT INTERVENTIONS LEADING TO CONDITIONS

EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS

Free mobile health screenings

EQUITABLE CONDITIONS

Ensure access to affordable healthcare

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

A healthy, active city
METHODOLOGY

PRIORITIZE AN AGENDA OF EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS
METHODOLOGY

PHASE III: MONITORING & RE-ASSESSING

BUILDING & IMPLEMENTING A THEORY OF CHANGE

ASSESSING EQUITY

LONG TERM
RE-EVALUATE STATE OF EQUITY & EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

SHORT TERM
ENGAGE STAKEHOLDERS+ REFINE OUTCOMES

MONITOR & RE-ASSESS
METHODOLOGY

A FRAMEWORK FOR EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT

SHORT TERM

ENGAGE
STAKEHOLDERS+

REFINE OUTCOMES

LONG TERM

MONITOR & RE-ASSESS

STATE OF EQUITY & EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PRECEDENT PLANS
LITERATURE REVIEW
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

EXISTING CONDITIONS
INDICATORS
SYNTHESIS

HYPOTHESIZE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY
COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

STATE OF EQUITY

EQUITABLE INTERVENTIONS

PROPOSE
EQUITABLE CONDITIONS

REFINE

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PROPOSE

PRIORITIZE

IMPLEMENT INTERVENTIONS

AFFECT CONDITIONS

PROGRESS TOWARDS OUTCOMES
CONTEX

RIVERFRONT: THEN & NOW

Source: Waterfront Redevelopment Corporation
CONTEXT

SURROUNDING NEIGHBORHOODS

Source: Kevin Hunter, Thomson Kao
STATE OF EQUITY
STATE OF EQUITY
COMMUNITY FRAGMENTATION
STATE OF EQUITY

UNEMPLOYMENT BY EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT

Education

High School or less 46%

College Graduate 28%

Source: American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY

UNEMPLOYMENT BY EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT

Source: American Community Survey 2008-2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>High School or less</th>
<th>College Graduate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Wilmington
STATE OF EQUITY

RACIAL DIVISIONS

Source: American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY

INCOME DIVISIONS

% COST-BURDENED RENTERS
57%

% CITY POP IN TRACTS
47%

Very Low Income Tracts
(Median Household Income ≤ 50% AMI)

Source: American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY

SUMMARY

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

EXISTING CONDITIONS

INDICATORS

SYNTHESIS

STATE OF EQUITY

HYPOTHEZIZE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY

COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PRECEDENT PLANS

LITERATURE REVIEW

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

COMMUNITY FRAGMENTATION

EDUCATION & SKILLS MISMATCH

INCOME & RACE DISPARITIES

DECLINING HOUSING AFFORDABILITY

Wilmington
EXISTING STRATEGY

ABANDONMENT

RIVERFRONT IN THE 1990s

Source: Riverfront Development Corporation
EXISTING STRATEGY

ORIGINAL VISION

INITIAL CONCEPT RENDERING

Source: Riverfront Development Corporation
EXISTING STRATEGY

SITE ORIENTATION

DOWNTOWN

RIVERFRONT

DELAWARE RIVER
EXISTING STRATEGY

REGIONAL ATTRACTIONS

BASEBALL STADIUM

WILDLIFE REFUGE

CHILDREN’S MUSEUM

Source: Kevin Hunter; Daniel Wolf
EXISTING STRATEGY

CORPORATE OFFICES

BARCLAYS

AAA HEADQUARTERS

CAPITAL ONE

Source: Kevin Hunter; Brian Agness
EXISTING STRATEGY

AUTO-ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT

Source: Kevin Hunter
EXISTING STRATEGY

HIGH-END HOUSING

CONDO HIGH RISE AND TOWNHOMES

LOFT APARTMENTS

Source: Kevin Hunter
EXISTING STRATEGY

STATE INITIATED PROJECT

$346M
public expenditure

$154M
infrastructure

$137M
economic dev.

$19M
remediation

$25M
city funds

Source: "Fiscal Impact of the Wilmington Riverfront," University of Delaware
EXISTING STRATEGY

INTENDED GOALS

Improve the Delaware Economy

Revitalize Wilmington to Attract New Residents
EXISTING STRATEGY

IMPACT: CHANGE IN MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME, 2000-2012

Source: Decennial Census 2000, American Community Survey 2008-2012
EXISTING STRATEGY

IMPACT: *CHANGE IN RIVERFRONT JOBS, 1997-2011*

RIVERFRONT

+2,000 NET NEW JOBS

$68K AVERAGE ANNUAL WAGE

Source: “Fiscal Impact of the Wilmington Riverfront,” University of Delaware
EXISTING STRATEGY

IMPACT: CHANGE IN CITYWIDE JOBS, 2002-2011

CITY
-2,900 NET JOBS

-1,500 $-

-5,500 $$

Source: Census Bureau (OnTheMap)
EXISTING STRATEGY

IMPACT: CHANGE IN CITYWIDE JOBS, 2002-2011

CITY
-2,900
NET JOBS

Source: Census Bureau (OnTheMap)
EXISTING STRATEGY

IMPACT: *INCREASED TAX BASE AND REVENUE*

$716M
private investment

$14.5M
average annual
state revenue

$4.5M
average annual
city revenue

Source: “Fiscal Impact of the Wilmington Riverfront,” University of Delaware
SYNTHESIS: RIVERFRONT DEVELOPMENT

SUCCESSES:
- Remediation & development
- Increased tax base

CHALLENGES:
- Does not target LMI residents
- Surrounding area in decline
PROPOSED STRATEGY
PROPOSED STRATEGY

WILMINGTON ASSETS

- LARGE DAYTIME OFFICE POPULATION
- EFFECTIVE REGIONAL SCHOOL SYSTEM
- LOCAL INTERMODAL PORT
- EASY ACCESS TO NORTHEAST CORRIDOR CITIES
- WELL MAINTAINED STREET INFRASTRUCTURE
- FOUNDATION AND PHILANTHROPIC FUNDING
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED OUTCOMES

RIVERFRONT

- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED CONDITIONS

RIVERFRONT

INTERVENTIONS
- Diversify economic opportunities
- Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
- Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
- Develop alternative transportation access
- Ensure availability of affordable housing
- Foster cooperation between Riverfront stakeholders and area residents
- Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED INTERVENTIONS

RIVERFRONT

- Recruit tenants that complement existing jobs
- Create inclusionary business strategy
data
- Study local serving retail options
- Require local hiring and living wages in leasing agreements
- Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods
- Improve access & crossings points
- Develop safe bicycle routes
- Improve transit access
- Use incentives to promote affordable housing
- Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
- Utilize participatory planning techniques
- Diversify economic opportunities
- Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
- Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
- Develop alternative transportation access
- Ensure availability of affordable housing
- Foster cooperation between Riverfront stakeholders and area residents
- Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

Economic Security & Opportunity

Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
PROPOSED STRATEGY

PRIORITIZED INTERVENTIONS

RIVERFRONT

- Recruit tenants that complement existing jobs
- Create inclusionary business strategy
- Study local serving retail options
- Require local hiring and living wages in leasing agreements
- Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods
- Improve access & crossings points
- Develop safe bicycle routes
- Improve transit access
- Use incentives to promote affordable housing
- Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
- Utilize participatory planning techniques
- Diversify economic opportunities
- Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
- Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
- Develop alternative transportation access
- Ensure availability of affordable housing
- Foster cooperation between Riverfront stakeholders and area residents
- Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

Economic Security & Opportunity

Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPLEMENT THEORY OF CHANGE

RIVERFRONT

Recruit tenants that complement existing jobs
Create inclusionary business strategy
Study local serving retail options
Require local hiring and living wages in leasing agreements
Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods
Improve access & crossings points
Develop safe bicycle routes
Improve transit access
Use incentives to promote affordable housing
Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
Utilize participatory planning techniques

Diversify economic opportunities
Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
Develop alternative transportation access
Ensure availability of affordable housing
Foster cooperation between Riverfront stakeholders and area residents
Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS
CONDITIONS
OUTCOMES

Prioritize
Implement
Affect
Progress Towards

State of Equity
Synthesis
Hypthesize Ideal State of Equity
Existing Conditions
Component of Equity
Precendent Plans
Stakeholder Interviews

Compare to Equity Components
Community Engagement
Literature Review
Indicators

SHORT TERM
ENGAGE
STAKEHOLDERS+
REFINE OUTCOMES

LONG TERM
MONITOR &
RE-ASSESS
RE-EVALUATE
STATE OF EQUITY &
EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

Wilmington
PROPOSED STRATEGY

DIVERSIFY ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES

RIVERFRONT

Create an inclusionary business strategy
Study local serving retail opportunities

Diversify economic opportunities

Economic Security & Opportunity

Stable & Supportive
Quality of Life

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES

Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods
Improve access & crossings points
Develop safe bicycle routes
Improve transit access
Use incentives to promote affordable housing
Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
Study local serving retail opportunities
Create an inclusionary business strategy
Diversify economic opportunities
Utilize participatory planning techniques

Ensure availability of affordable housing
Foster cooperation between Riverfront stakeholders and area residents
Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
Develop alternative transportation access

Diversify economic opportunities
Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods

Improve access and crossing points

Use incentives to promote affordable housing

Create a Citizen Advisory Committee

Utilize participatory planning techniques

Integrate Riverfront into the surrounding neighborhoods

Ensure availability of affordable housing

Foster cooperation between Riverfront stakeholders and area residents

Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning

Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

Economic Security & Opportunity

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES

PROPOSED STRATEGY

INTEGRATE RIVERFRONT INTO SURROUNDING NEIGHBORHOOD
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ENSURE AVAILABILITY OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING

RIVERFRONT

- Use incentives to promote affordable housing
- Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
- Utilize participatory planning techniques
- Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods
- Improve access & crossing points
- Develop safe bicycle routes
- Improve transit access
- Use incentives to promote affordable housing
- Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
- Study local serving retail options
- Create inclusionary business strategy
- Require local hiring and living wages in leasing agreements
- Utilize participatory planning techniques
- Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
- Diversify economic opportunities
- Develop alternative transportation access
- Incorporate local resident input into Riverfront planning
- Ensure availability of affordable housing

Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
PROPOSED STRATEGY

INTEGRATE RESIDENT INPUT IN RIVERFRONT PLANNING

RIVERFRONT

INTERVENTIONS

- Focus development adjacent to existing neighborhoods
- Improve access & crossings points
- Improve transit access
- Use incentives to promote affordable housing
- Create a Citizen Advisory Committee
- Study local serving retail options
- Create an inclusionary business strategy
- Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
- Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
- Incorporate participatory planning techniques

CONDITIONS

- Diversity economic opportunities
- Diverse economic opportunities
- Increase local hiring by Riverfront employers
- Integrate Riverfront into surrounding neighborhoods
- Incorporate participatory planning techniques

OUTCOMES

- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Incorporate local resident input in Riverfront planning

Wilmington
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPROVE ACCESS: **BARRIERS**

VIADUCT UNDERPASS

UNDERUTILIZED LAND

Source: Thomson Kao
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPROVE ACCESS: UNDERPASSES
FOCUS FUTURE REDEVELOPMENT: UNDERUTILIZED LAND

PROPOSED STRATEGY
PROPOSED STRATEGY

FOCUS FUTURE REDEVELOPMENT: **EXISTING ACTIVITY**
PROPOSED STRATEGY

FOCUS FUTURE REDEVELOPMENT: CONNECTING CORRIDORS

- Lower Market Street
- Justison Street
- Retail Cluster
- Beech & Maryland
- Martin Luther King Blvd
- 2nd St
- Market St
- Walnut St
- Christina River
- Beech St
- Maryland Ave
- Justison St
- West St
- Wilmington

Map showing key areas and streets in the proposed redevelopment strategy.
PROPOSED STRATEGY

FOCUS FUTURE REDEVELOPMENT: BEECH STREET CASE STUDY

Wilmington
BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: EXISTING USE

PROPOSED STRATEGY
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: AFFORDABLE HOUSING
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: AFFORDABLE HOUSING

Source: Wilmington Housing Partnership
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: AFFORDABLE HOUSING
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: LOCAL SERVING RETAIL

![Map of Beech Street case study with various land use types labeled: Residential, Office, Retail, Ground-floor Retail, Cultural, Parking Garage / Utilities, Green Space. The map indicates the proposed development strategy with a focus on local serving retail.]
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: *LOCAL SERVING RETAIL*
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: *LOCAL SERVING RETAIL*

CVS IN DAVIDSON, NC

CVS IN NORMAL, IL

WALMART IN FORT TOTTEN, WASHINGTON, D.C.

Source: University United; UrbanReviewSTL.com; Walmart
BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: INCLUSIONARY BUSINESS
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: INCLUSIONARY BUSINESS

Source: Deskmag via Wikimedia Commons
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: GREEN NETWORK
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BEECH STREET CASE STUDY: GREEN NETWORK

JUSTISON LANDING

RIVERFRONT BIOSWALE

RIVERWALK

BRANDYWINE RAIN GARDEN

Source: Oasis Design Group, TheDCH.org
PROPOSED STRATEGY

WIDER APPLICATION: BEECH STREET CASE STUDY
PROPOSED STRATEGY

WIDER APPLICATION: FUTURE DEVELOPMENT
PROPOSED STRATEGY

WIDER APPLICATION: A COMPLETE COMMUNITY

[Map of Wilmington with various color-coded areas indicating different land uses such as Residential, Office, Retail, Ground-floor Retail, Cultural, Parking Garage / Utilities, and Green Space.]
PROPOSED STRATEGY

PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

Source: Skinker DeBaliviere Community Council
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPLEMENT THEORY OF CHANGE

CITYWIDE

- Sector-based workforce development strategy
- Explore mid-skill industry growth potential
- Implement local hire requirements
- Create a Small Business Advocate Office
- Make tax structure more progressive
- Attract fresh food markets into food deserts
- Fill any gaps in public transportation network
- Develop a comprehensive bike network
- Calm wide and high-speed streets
- Ensure that zoning is not exclusionary
- Enforce fair housing laws
- Better leverage existing housing initiatives
- Reform tax abatement system
- Remediate brownfields
- Mitigate natural hazards
- Pilot a participatory budgeting program
- Institutionalize engagement in the development process
- Create a roundtable coalition of leaders
- Develop a new citywide strategic plan

- Increase skills base & human capital
- Increase economic base diversity & opportunity
- Employ a fair and effective tax structure
- Improve access to health and nutrition
- Expand alternative transportation access
- Increase access to affordable housing
- Promote environmental justice in underserved areas
- Integrate community voice into visioning and development
- Coordinate revitalization efforts and develop citywide vision

- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS    CONDITIONS    OUTCOMES
PROPOSED STRATEGY

INCREASE SKILLS BASE AND HUMAN CAPITAL

CITYWIDE

Sector-based workforce development strategy
- Create a Small Business Advocate Office
- Make tax structure more progressive
- Attract fresh food markets into food deserts
- Fill key gaps in public transportation network
- Develop a comprehensive bike network
- Calm wide and high-speed streets
- Ensure that zoning is not exclusionary
- Enforce fair housing laws
- Better leverage existing housing initiatives
- Reform tax abatement system
- Remediate brownfields
- Mitigate natural hazards
- Pilot a participatory budgeting program
- Institutionalize engagement in the development process
- Create a roundtable coalition of leaders
- Develop a new citywide strategic plan

Increase skills base & human capital
- Employ a fair and effective tax structure
- Improve access to health and nutrition
- Expand alternative transportation access
- Increase access to affordable housing
- Promote environmental justice in underserved areas
- Integrate community voice into visioning and development
- Coordinate revitalization efforts and develop citywide vision

Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive
- Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive
- Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS | CONDITIONS | OUTCOMES
CITYWIDE STRATEGY

SECTOR-BASED WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT

Employers

Job

Job

Job

Workers

Sector Strategy Program

- Dedicated Staff
- Dedicated Funding
**PROPOSED STRATEGY**

**INTEGRATE COMMUNITY VOICE**

*CITYWIDE*

- Implement local hire requirements
- Sector-based workforce development strategy
- Explore mid-skill industry growth potential
- Create a Small Business Advocate Office
- Make tax structure more progressive
- Attract fresh food markets into food deserts
- Fill key gaps in public transportation network
- Develop a comprehensive bike network
- Calm wide and high-speed streets
- Ensure that zoning is not exclusionary

**Conditions**

- Increase skills base & human capital
- Increase economic base diversity & opportunity
- Employ a fair and effective tax structure
- Improve access to health and nutrition

**Interventions**

- Pilot a participatory budgeting program
- Institutionalize engagement in the development process
- Integrate community voice into visioning and development

**Outcomes**

- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

**Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership**
3. Be Cool in the 45th – Clarendon Library
$750,000
The current air conditioning unit has outlived its purpose. A new one is needed to keep this library fully operational.
2035 Nostrand Ave

4. Be Cool in the 45th – P.S. 198
$72,000
Provide air conditioning for 1 1/2 floors of classrooms, library, science and computer rooms.
4105 Farragut Rd

5. E-Tech Campus for CAMBA Beacon Program at P.S. 269
$150,000
Provide new desktop, laptops, security cart, and smartboard for students at afterschool program.
1957 Nostrand Ave

6. E-Tech Campus at P.S. 109
$150,000
Provide new laptops, security cart, and smartboard for students at school.
1001 E. 45th St

8. Community Resource Center
$350,000
Purchase of a facility to serve as a community resource center offering job training, youth & seniors recreation, health & wellness programs.
1073 Utica Ave (Beverly & Tilden)

9. Field Lić
$300,000
Installation of field lights to increase the usage of the field and reduce violence.
Tilden Educational C 5800 Tilden Ave

10. Perform Studio
$150,000
Revamp an exist area in the school into a performing arts studio.
Tilden Educational C 5800 Tilden Ave

11. Track Extension
$150,000
Extend the track from 380 meters to a standard 400 meter track.
Tilden Educational C 5800 Tilden Ave
SYNTHESIS

LESSONS LEARNED

ADVANTAGES:
• Institutionalizes public participation
• Links residents with economic opportunities
• Leverages growth on the Riverfront

CHALLENGES:
• Obtaining continued private investment
• Changing political culture
• Measuring impact

Source: Kevin Hunter
LANCASTER
AGRICULTURE, INDUSTRY, & REINVENTION

Source: Ellie Devyatkin
CONTEXT

DISTRIBUTION OF POVERTY: 2012

Source: Decennial Census 2000; American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY
HOUSING COST BURDEN: VERY LOW INCOME TRACTS, 2012

% COST-BURDENED RENTERS
55.8%

% CITY POP IN TRACTS
52.8%

Source: Decennial Census 2000; American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY

INCOME DISPARITY: 2000 - 2012

Legend

- **Richest Tracts**
- **County**
- **City**
- **Poorest Tracts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Poorest Tracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$112,000</td>
<td>$63,000</td>
<td>$25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$115,000</td>
<td>$56,000</td>
<td>$37,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Decennial Census 2000; American Community Survey 2008-2012
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Attainment:</th>
<th>Less Than High School</th>
<th>High School Graduate</th>
<th>Some College</th>
<th>Bachelor’s Degree or Higher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Share of Population:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-Growth Sectors:</td>
<td>Accommodation and Food Services</td>
<td>Accommodation and Food Services</td>
<td>Health Care and Social Assistance</td>
<td>Health Care and Social Assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transportation and Warehousing</td>
<td>Transportation and Warehousing</td>
<td>Educational Services</td>
<td>Educational Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other Services</td>
<td>Other Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

= one percentage point of the age 25+ population

STATE OF EQUITY

WHERE ARE THE JOBS? WHO HAS THEM?

Source: US Census OnTheMap
STATE OF EQUITY

SUMMARY

CHALLENGES

PRECEDENT PLANS
LITERATURE REVIEW
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

COMPONENTS OF EQUITY

EXISTING CONDITIONS
INDICATORS
SYNTHESIS

STATE OF EQUITY

HYPOTHEZISE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY
COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

DECLINING HOUSING AFFORDABILITY
EDUCATIONAL DISPARITIES
INCOME DISPARITIES
OCCUPATIONAL BIFURCATION

STATE OF EQUITY

Lancaster
EXISTING STRATEGY
EXISTING STRATEGY

INTENDED GOALS

- Revitalize Downtown
- Institutionalize Art in Lancaster’s Identity
$36 MILLION: amount of money spent locally by county residents at arts-related events per year

736 jobs supported by arts-related spending

Source: LancasterARTs and Franklin & Marshall College
EXISTING STRATEGY

ECONOMIC IMPACT OF THE ARTS

Declining Downtown Housing Vacancy

Source: Decennial Census 2000; American Community Survey 2008-2012
EXISTING STRATEGY

ECONOMIC IMPACT OF THE ARTS

Declining Downtown Housing Vacancy

- 2000: 11.7%
- 2012: 8.1%

Uneven Commercial Revitalization

- Gallery Row: Neary 100% occupancy
- Lancaster Square: Vacant since 1970s

Source: Decennial Census 2000; American Community Survey 2008-2012; Meg Dahlgren, Ellie Devyatkin
5% of job growth can be directly attributed to the arts.

ECONOMIC IMPACT OF THE ARTS: JOB GROWTH 2000-2011

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, County Business Patterns
5% of job growth can be directly attributed to the arts.

53% of new jobs were in health care, social assistance, and education.

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, County Business Patterns
EXISTING STRATEGY

ANCHOR INSTITUTION EXPANSION

Source: Lancaster Economic Development Corporation, Franklin & Marshall College, Lancaster General Hospital
EXISTING STRATEGY

SYNTHESIS: ANCHOR INSTITUTION INVESTMENTS

SUCCESES
• High quality employment

CHALLENGES
• Connecting to LMI Residents

Source: Franklin & Marshal College
PROPOSED STRATEGY
PROPOSED STRATEGY

LANCASTER ASSETS

- STRONG ANCHOR PRESENCE
- HIGH CAPACITY CIVIC ORGANIZATION
- PROGRESSIVE POLITICAL LEADERSHIP
- ENGAGED AND COLLABORATIVE FUNDERS
SELECTED OUTCOMES

ECONOMIC SECURITY & OPPORTUNITY

STABLE & SUPPORTIVE QUALITY OF LIFE

INCLUSIVE & PROGRESSIVE COMMUNITY LEADERSHIP
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED CONDITIONS

Ensure job quality in growing sectors
Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
Expand wealth-building opportunities for residents
Alleviate housing cost burden
Expand access to critical family-supporting services
Expand community engagement opportunities
Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth

Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS
CONDITIONS
OUTCOMES
PRIORITIZED INTERVENTIONS

Targeted living wage ordinance
Local contracting requirements
Job training & placement assistance
Labor-community partnerships
Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses
Shared-appreciation mortgages
Community task force to assess service needs
Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
Accessible meeting locations
Translation services
Transportation services to public meetings
Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

Ensure job quality in growing sectors
Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
Expand wealth-building opportunities for residents
Alleviate housing cost burden
Expand access to critical family-supporting services
Expand community engagement opportunities
Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth

Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS
CONDITIONS
OUTCOMES
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPLEMENT THEORY OF CHANGE

EQUITY COMPONENTS
PRECEDENT PLANS
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
LITERATURE REVIEW
INDICATORS

INTERVENTIONS
CONDITIONS
OUTCOMES

Targeted Living wage ordinance
Local contracting requirements
Job training & placement assistance
Labor-community partnerships
Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses
Shared-appreciation mortgages
Community task force to assess service needs
Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
Accessible meeting locations
Translation services
Transportation services to public meetings
Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

Ensure job quality in growing sectors
Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
Expand wealth-building opportunities for residents
Alleviate housing cost burden
Expand access to critical family-supporting services
Expand community engagement opportunities
Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth

Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

Lancaster
ENSURE JOB QUALITY

**PROPOSED STRATEGY**

**Economic Security & Opportunity**
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

**Ensure job quality in growing sectors**
- Expand wealth-building opportunities for residents
- Alleviate housing cost burden
- Expand access to critical family-supporting services
- Expand community engagement opportunities
- Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth

**Targeted Living wage ordinance**
- Job training & placement assistance
- Labor-community partnerships
- Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses
- Shared-appreciation mortgages
- Community task force to assess service needs
- Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
- Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
- Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
- Accessible meeting locations
- Translation services
- Transportation services to public meetings
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

**INTERVENTIONS**

**CONDITIONS**

**OUTCOMES**
PROPOSED STRATEGY

CONNECT HIGH-QUALITY JOBS TO LMI RESIDENTS

INTERVENTIONS
- Local contracting requirements
- Job training & placement assistance
- Labor-community partnerships

CONDITIONS
- Alleviate housing cost burden
- Expand access to critical family-supporting services
- Expand community engagement opportunities
- Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth
- Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
- Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
- Accessible meeting locations
- Translation services
- Transportation services to public meetings
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

OUTCOMES
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

Lancaster
PROPOSED STRATEGY

EXPAND WEALTH BUILDING OPPORTUNITIES

INTERVENTIONS
- Targeted Living wage ordinance
- Local contracting requirements
- Labor-community partnerships
- Shared-appreciation mortgages
- Community task force to assess service needs
- Accessible meeting locations
- Translation services
- Transportation services to public meetings
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

CONDITIONS
- Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses
- Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
- Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
- Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
- Expand access to critical family-supporting services
- Expand community engagement opportunities
- Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth

OUTCOMES
- Ensure job quality in growing sectors
- Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
- Expand wealth-building opportunities

Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ALLEVIATE HOUSING COST BURDEN

INTERVENTIONS
- Targeted living wage ordinance
- Local contracting requirements
- Job training & placement assistance
- Labor-community partnerships
- Shared-appreciation mortgages
- Community task force to assess service needs
- Accessible meeting locations
- Translation services
- Transportation services to public meetings
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support
- Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses
- Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
- Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
- Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

CONDITIONS
- Ensure job quality in growing sectors
- Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
- Expand community engagement opportunities
- Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth

OUTCOMES
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

STABILIZE & SUPPORT QUALITY OF LIFE

Expand access to critical family-supporting services
Expand community engagement opportunities
Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth
Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
Ensure job quality in growing sectors

ECONOMIC SECURITY & OPPORTUNITY

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth
Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
Ensure job quality in growing sectors

Lancaster
EXPAND ACCESS TO CRITICAL FAMILY-SUPPORTING SERVICES

**INTERVENTIONS**
- Community task force to assess service needs
- Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
- Transportation services to public meetings
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

**CONDITIONS**
- Targeted Living wage ordinance
- Local contracting requirements
- Job training & placement assistance
- Labor-community partnerships
- Shared-appreciation mortgages
- Community task force to assess service needs
- Accessible meeting locations
- Translation services
- Transportation services to public meetings
- Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses
- Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools
- Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
- Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
- Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

**OUTCOMES**
- Ensure job quality in growing sectors
- Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

- Ensure all residents share in benefits of economic growth
- Expand community engagement opportunities
- Expand access to critical family-supporting services

**PROPOSED STRATEGY**
- Lancaster
ENSURE ALL RESIDENTS SHARE IN BENEFITS OF GROWTH

PROPOSED STRATEGY

ENSURE ALL RESIDENTS SHARE IN BENEFITS OF GROWTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVENTIONS</th>
<th>CONDITIONS</th>
<th>OUTCOMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Targeted Living wage ordinance</td>
<td>Ensure job quality in growing sectors</td>
<td>Economic Security &amp; Opportunity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local contracting requirements</td>
<td>Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents</td>
<td>Stable &amp; Supportive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job training &amp; placement assistance</td>
<td>Expand wealth-building opportunities for residents</td>
<td>Inclusive &amp; Progressive Community Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor-community partnerships</td>
<td>Alleviate housing cost burden</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentivize cooperative/ESOP conversions of local businesses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shared-appreciation mortgages</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community task force to assess service needs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work with local service providers to co-locate key services with public schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Community benefits requirements for projects receiving public support

Ensure economic growth benefits all residents
PROPOSED STRATEGY

EXPAND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT OPPORTUNITIES

- Stakeholder review for projects receiving public support
- Representation of LMI residents in boards/committees
- Translation services
- Accessible meeting locations
- Transportation services to public meetings

Ensure job quality in growing sectors
Connect high-quality jobs to LMI residents
Expand wealth-building opportunities for residents
Alleviate housing cost burden

Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive
Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS
CONDITIONS
OUTCOMES
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: OVERVIEW

ANCHOR
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: OVERVIEW

ANCHOR

CITY
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: OVERVIEW

ANCHOR

CITY

COMMUNITY

THRIVING LANCASTER

Lancaster
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: ANCHOR BENEFITS

- Expanded customer base
- Improved access to human capital
- Improved quality of services
- Improved relationships with suppliers and contractors
ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: CITY BENEFITS

• Improved tax base
• Stable economy
• Increased competitive advantage
• Improved image
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: COMMUNITY BENEFITS

- Increased access to employment
- Improved access to services
- Expanded access to capital
- More opportunities for inclusion

Lancaster
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED DEVELOPMENT: \textit{Shared Benefits}

- \textbf{Higher Economic Multiplier}
- \textbf{Thriving Lancaster}
- \textbf{Higher Wages}
- \textbf{Stronger Community Ties}
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ANCHOR-BASED THEORY OF CHANGE

INTERVENTIONS
- Establish local hire benchmarks
- Develop high school bridge programs
- Establish local procurement preferences
- Expand working capital for small businesses
- Create small business TA center
- Univeristy-assisted community schools
- Community-based participatory research
- Community advisory boards

CONDITIONS
- Expand LMI access to employment
- Leverage anchor purchasing power
- Expand capacity of local businesses
- Develop community-anchor partnerships
- Expand opportunities for community involvement

OUTCOMES
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

Lancaster
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ECONOMIC SECURITY & OPPORTUNITY

LEVERAGE ANCHOR PURCHASING POWER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVENTIONS</th>
<th>CONDITIONS</th>
<th>OUTCOMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establish local procurement preferences</td>
<td>Leverage anchor purchasing power</td>
<td>Economic Security &amp; Opportunity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create small business TA center</td>
<td>Expand LMI access to employment in businesses</td>
<td>Stable &amp; Supportive Quality of Life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University-assisted community schools</td>
<td>Develop community-anchor partnerships</td>
<td>Inclusive &amp; Progressive Community Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community-based participatory research</td>
<td>Expand opportunities for community involvement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community advisory boards</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lancaster
PROPOSED STRATEGY

LEVERAGE ANCHOR PURCHASING POWER

LOCAL PROCUREMENT BENCHMARKS
PROPOSED STRATEGY

ECONOMIC SECURITY & OPPORTUNITY

EXPAND CAPACITY OF LOCAL BUSINESSES

- Establish local hire benchmarks
- Working capital for small businesses
- Create small business TA center
- University-assisted community schools
- Community-based participatory research
- Community advisory boards
- Expand capacity of local businesses
- Expand LMI access to employment
- Leverage anchor purchasing
- Develop community-anchor partnerships
- Expand opportunities for community involvement

Economic Security & Opportunity

Stable & Supportive
Quality of Life

Inclusive & Progressive
Community Leadership

INTERVENTIONS | CONDITIONS | OUTCOMES

Lancaster
PROPOSED STRATEGY

EXPAND CAPACITY OF LOCAL BUSINESSES

WORKING CAPITAL FOR SMALL BUSINESSES

COMMUNITY FIRST FUND, LANCASTER

Source: Lancaster: Architecture of Faith (Blog)
PROPOSED STRATEGY

EXPAND CAPACITY OF LOCAL BUSINESSES

LOCAL CONTRACTOR/VENDOR TA CENTER
LESSONS LEARNED

ADVANTAGES
• Potential for mutual benefit
• Leverage public subsidy to work for residents
• Builds on existing assets

CHALLENGES
• Coordinating actors
• Building capacity

Source: Wikimedia Commons
BETHLEHEM
THE CITY

NOTABLE SITES

LEHIGH RIVER

DOWNTOWN

BETHLEHEM STEEL SITE

LEHIGH UNIVERSITY
1995 TO 2009

BETHLEHEM STEEL PLANT CLOSES

SANDS OF BETHLEHEM OPENS

Source: Bob Jagendorf, Las Vegas Sands Corp.
SANDS CASINO & STEELSTACKS

Source: Frank T Smith, Express-Times File Photo, Bill Adams
CONTEXT

LVIP VII & SOUTH BETHLEHEM

Source: Ryan Debold, Amy Verbofsky
STATE OF EQUITY

INCOME DISTRIBUTION:

CHANGE IN MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME, 2000-2012

Poorest Tracts: 14%
Richest Tracts: 3%
City: 7%
County: 7%

Source: Decennial Census 2000, American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY

COST BURDENED RENTERS: VERY LOW INCOME TRACTS, 2012

% COST-BURDENED
61%

% POP IN THESE TRACTS
52%

Very Low Income Tracts
(Median Household Income ≤ 50% AMI)

Source: American Community Survey 2008-2012
## State of Equity

### Employment and Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Attainment:</th>
<th>Less Than High School</th>
<th>High School Graduate</th>
<th>Some College</th>
<th>Bachelor’s Degree or Higher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Share of Population:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■</td>
<td>■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■</td>
<td>■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■</td>
<td>■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■ ■</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>High-Growth Sectors:</strong></td>
<td>Transportation and Warehousing</td>
<td>Administrative and Support</td>
<td>Health Care and Social Assistance</td>
<td>Health Care and Social Assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Accommodation and Food Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

■ = one percentage point of the age 25+ population

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, County Business Patterns; American Community Survey 2008-2012
STATE OF EQUITY

JOB DISTRIBUTION:  WHO WORKS IN BETHLEHEM?

Source: US Census On The Map
STATE OF EQUITY

SUMMARY

CHALLENGES

EXISTING CONDITIONS

STATE OF EQUITY

SYNTHESIS

HYPOTHEZIZE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY

COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

PRECEDENT PLANS

LITERATURE REVIEW

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

INCREASING HOUSING COST BURDEN

IMBALANCED JOB DISTRIBUTION

DECLINING INCOMES

SKILLS MISMATCH

INCREASING HOUSING COST BURDEN

IMBALANCED JOB DISTRIBUTION

DECLINING INCOMES

SKILLS MISMATCH
EXISTING STRATEGY
EXISTING STRATEGY

BETHLEHEM STEEL SITE
EXISTING STRATEGY

INTENDED OUTCOMES

- Remediation
- Historic Preservation
- Revenue Generation
EXISTING STRATEGY

JOB OPPORTUNITIES AT THE CASINO

NORTHAMPTON COMMUNITY COLLEGE, FOWLER CAMPUS

LOCAL HIRE

Source: Las Vegas Sands Corp., 4 Blocks International
EXISTING STRATEGY

ECOONOMIC DEVELOPMENT TOOLS

Source: Ryan Debold
EXISTING STRATEGY

IMPACT

$800M total tax rev.

$9.6M host fees/year

2,200 total jobs

35% jobs held by minorities

SANDS BETHLEHEM RESORT

Source: Express Times File Photo
EXISTING STRATEGY

SYNTHESIS

SUCCESES
• New jobs and tax revenue
• Site reactivation

CHALLENGES
• Opportunity gap
• Housing costs

Source: Amy Verbofsky
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BETHLEHEM ASSETS

- QUALITY HOUSING STOCK
- STRONG REGIONAL SCHOOLS
- ROBUST COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED OUTCOMES

CITYWIDE

- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

INTERVENTIONS

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES

Bethlehem
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED CONDITIONS

CITYWIDE

INTERVENTIONS

- Diversify community representation
- Bolster M/W/DBE Capacity
- Expand workforce training & education programs
- Implement employer-led investment programs
- Increase / Stabilize Affordable Housing Supply

CONDITIONS

- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

OUTCOMES

- PRIORITIZE
- IMPLEMENT
- AFFECT
- PROGRESS TOWARDS

SYNTHESIS

- HYPOTHESIZE IDEAL STATE OF EQUITY
- COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS
- PRECEDENT PLANS
- STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS
- LITERATURE REVIEW

INDICATORS

- SELECTED CONDITIONS
  - CITYWIDE
PROPOSED STRATEGY

SELECTED INTERVENTIONS

CITYWIDE

INTERVENTIONS

- Advertisement of open board positions
- Sustained community participation beyond execution
- Local M/W/DBE registry
- Technical assistance and training
- Small-business loans
- Procurement and service agreements
- Co-operative and vocational education programs
- Adult ESL classes
- STEM education curriculum in local school system
- Better minority student recruitment
- Local hire and diversity agreements
- Rotational leadership programs
- Provide below-market-rent commercial space
- Affordability preservation programs
- Home repair and maintenance financing
- Small-scale municipal incentives
- Implement employer-assisted housing

CONDITIONS

- Diversify community representation
- Bolster M/W/DBE Capacity
- Expand workforce training & education programs
- Implement employer-led investment programs
- Increase / Stabilize Affordable Housing Supply

OUTCOMES

- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

SHORT TERM

ENGAGE STAKEHOLDERS+

REFINE OUTCOMES

LONG TERM

MONITOR & RE-ASSESS

RE-EVALUATE STATE OF EQUITY & EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

BETHLEHEM

PREVIEW PLANS

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

COMPARE TO EQUITY COMPONENTS

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

LITERATURE REVIEW
PROPOSED STRATEGY

PRIORITIZED INTERVENTIONS

CITYWIDE

- Advertisement of open board positions
- Sustained community participation beyond execution
- Local M/W/DBE registry
- Technical assistance and training
- Small-business loans
- Procurement and service agreements
- Co-operative and vocational education programs
- Adult ESL classes
- STEM education curriculum in local school system
- Better minority student recruitment
- Local hire and diversity agreements
- Rotational leadership programs
- Provide below-market-rent commercial space
- Affordability preservation programs
- Home repair and maintenance financing
- Small-scale municipal incentives
- Implement employer-assisted housing

Diversify community representation
Bolster M/W/DBE Capacity
Expand workforce training & education programs
Implement employer-led investment programs
Increase / Stabilize Affordable Housing Supply

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
Economic Security & Opportunity
Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BOLSTER M/W/DBE CAPACITY

CITYWIDE

Technical Assistance and Training

Local M/W/DBE registry

Procurement and service agreements

Bolster M/W/DBE Capacity

Diversify community representation

Economic Security & Opportunity

Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership

Increase / Stabilize Affordable Housing Supply

Implement employer-assisted housing

Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

Expand workforce training & education programs

Implement employer-led investment programs

Local hire and diversity agreements

Provide below-market-rent commercial space

Home repair and maintenance financing

Implement employer-assisted housing

INTERVENTIONS

CONDITIONS

OUTCOMES

Bethlehem
PROPOSED STRATEGY

EXPAND HEALTHCARE TRAINING & EDUCATION PROGRAMS

CITYWIDE

INTERVENTIONS

- Cooperative and vocational training programs
- Technical assistance and training
- Local M/W/DBE registry
- Local hire and diversity agreements
- Provide below-market-rent commercial space
- Home repair and maintenance financing
- Implement employer-assisted housing

CONDITIONS

- Sustained community participation beyond execution
- Diversify community representation
- Increase / Stabilize Affordable Housing Supply

OUTCOMES

- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Expand workforce training & education programs
- Bolster M/W/DBE Capacity
- Diversify community representation
- Citywide

Bethlehem
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPLEMENT EMPLOYER-LED INVESTMENT PROGRAMS

CITYWIDE

- Local M/W/DBE registry
- Technical assistance and training
- Small-business loans
- Advertisement of open board positions
- Sustained community participation beyond execution
- Procurement and service agreements
- Co-operative and vocational education programs
- Adult ESL classes
- STEM education curriculum in local school system
- Better minority student recruitment
- Local hire and diversity agreements
- Provide below market-rent commercial space
- Implement employer-led investment programs
- Bolster M/W/DBE Capacity
- Expand workforce training & education programs
- Diversify community representation
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Economic Security & Opportunity
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life
- Housing Supply
- Implementation of employer-led investment programs citywide

INTERVENTIONS  CONDITIONS  OUTCOMES
PROPOSED STRATEGY

PRIORITIZE BUSINESS CREATION AT LVIP VII

SITE-SPECIFIC

INTERVENTIONS

- Provide trained and in-training local employees
- Partner with Lincoln Property Trust in marketing campaign
- Historic Preservation Tax Credits
- CRIZ implementation
- Listings of homes and land/space for sale
- Continue to Implement South Bethlehem Greenway Plan
- Implement Eastern Gateway plans
- Economic Security & Opportunity

CONDITIONS

- Expand 4 Blocks International Effort
- Enhance physical connections to Steel site
- Preserve existing Steel structures
- Employ-assisted housing
- Historic Preservation Tax Credits
- CRIZ implementation
- Inclusive & Progressive Community Leadership
- Stable & Supportive Quality of Life

OUTCOMES

- Prioritize Business Creation at LVIP
- International Effort
- Steel structures
- LVIP

Bethlehem
PROPOSED STRATEGY

CULINARY CENTER PROPOSAL

[Map showing Bethlehem's geographical features and proposed culinary center proposal, with symbols indicating steel site boundary, cold drawn building, cultural/entertainment, existing structures, vacant structures for adaptive reuse, and public open space.]
PROPOSED STRATEGY

CULINARY CENTER PROPOSAL

GROUND FLOOR RESTAURANT/KITCHEN INCUBATOR

Source: GoogleMaps
PROPOSED STRATEGY

CULINARY CENTER PROPOSAL

GROUND FLOOR RESTAURANT/KITCHEN INCUBATOR

Source: GoogleMaps
PROPOSED STRATEGY

CULINARY CENTER PROPOSAL

UPPER FLOOR RESIDENTIAL/OFFICE

Source: GoogleMaps
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPLEMENT EMPLOYER LED INVESTMENT PROGRAMS

PROVIDE BELOW-MARKET RENT COMMERCIAL SPACE

$20.82
Average hourly rate for incubator kitchen rental
- Econsult, U.S. Kitchen Incubators: An Industry Snapshot

$25
Average hourly rate for commercial kitchen rental
- Chefs Center of California, Greensgrow Farms

Source: Hao Wei Yang, The Grid Philly
PROPOSED STRATEGY

EXPAND WORKFORCE TRAINING AND EDUCATION PROGRAMS

COOPERATIVE AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROGRAMS

POTENTIAL PARTNERS

• NCC Culinary Arts Program
• NCC Hospitality Workshops like ServSafe
• Bethlehem Area Vocational and Technical School

Source: La Cocina
PROPOSED STRATEGY

BOLSTER M/W/DBE CAPACITY

LOCAL M/W/DBE REGISTRY

Let’s get CERTIFIED

DBE DISADVANTAGED BUSINESS ENTERPRISE SMALL BUSINESSES

KITCHEN USERS

- 61% Women
- 28% Low-Income
- 32% Minorities

- Econsult, U.S. Kitchen Incubators: An Industry Snapshot

Source: Washington State Office of Minority and Women’s Business Enterprises
PROPOSED STRATEGY

LVIP VII BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT

Source: Amy Verbofsky
PROPOSED STRATEGY

LVIP VII BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT

- Bethworks Site
- LVIP VII
- CRIZ
PROPOSED STRATEGY

IMPLEMENT EMPLOYER LED INVESTMENT PROGRAMS

LOCAL HIRE AND DIVERSITY AGREEMENTS

“PUTTING THE GREATER LEHIGH VALLEY BACK TO WORK” JOB FAIR AT ARTSQUEST

Source: April Bartholomew, The Morning Call
PROPOSED STRATEGY

PRIORITIZE BUSINESS CREATION AT LVIP

PROVIDE TRAINED/IN-TRAINING FOR LOCAL EMPLOYEES
SYNTHESIS

LESSONS LEARNED

ADVANTAGES
• Formalizes a process for addressing equity
• Leverages public subsidy to work for residents
• Links development with local residents and businesses
• Builds on existing assets

CHALLENGES
• Obtaining private financing and public subsidy
• Measuring impact
CONCLUSION
SYNTHESIS

SUCCESS FACTORS

COORDINATION
across interests

Source: Meg Dahlgren

LANCASTER CITY HALL
SYNTHESIS

SUCCESS FACTORS

COORDINATION
across interests

LEADERSHIP
promoting equity

Source: Meg Dahlgren
SYNTHESIS

SUCCESS FACTORS

COORDINATION
across interests

LEADERSHIP
promoting equity

CUSTOMIZE
development strategies

Source: Meg Dahlgren
RACE TO THE BOTTOM?

The New York Times
The American Middle Class Is No Longer the World’s Richest

The Augusta Chronicle
Companies receive incentives, fail to deliver jobs

The Uselessness of Economic Development Incentives
RICHARD FLORIDA  DEC 07, 2012  29 COMMENTS
QUESTIONS TO ADDRESS

MONEY

What are the funding sources?
SYNTHESIS

QUESTIONS TO ADDRESS

MONEY
What are the funding sources?

PLACE
Are successes replicable?

Source: Amy Verbofsky
SYNTHESIS

QUESTIONS TO ADDRESS

MONEY
What are the funding sources?

PLACE
Are successes replicable?

PEOPLE
Who will monitor and re-evaluate?

Source: Amy Verbofsky
METHODOLOGY

SHORT TERM
- Engage Stakeholders
- Refine Outcomes

LONG TERM
- Monitor & Re-assess
- Re-evaluate State of Equity & Equitable Outcomes

Components of Equity

Equitable Interventions
- Propose
- Refine

Equitable Conditions
- Propose
- Refine

Equitable Outcomes
- Propose
- Refine

Prioritize

Implement
- Interventions
- Conditions
- Outcomes

Affect

Progress Towards

Precedent Plans
- Literature Review
- Community Engagement
- Stakeholder Interviews

Synthesis
- State of Equity
  - Hypothesize Ideal State of Equity
  - Compare to Equity Components

Indicators

Monitor & Re-assess
EXPANDING THE SCOPE

AT ALL LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT

LOCAL

- Equity Outcomes in Project Planning
- Formalized Planning Advisory Boards
- Forum for Knowledge Sharing
EXPANDING THE SCOPE

AT ALL LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT

LOCAL

- Equity Outcomes in Project Planning
- Formalized Planning Advisory Boards
- Forum for Knowledge Sharing

STATE

- Revise Economic Development Programs
- Require Equity Assessments
- Improve Regional Collaboration
## EXPANDING THE SCOPE

### AT ALL LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOCAL</th>
<th>STATE</th>
<th>NATIONAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Equity Outcomes in Project Planning</td>
<td>Revise Economic Development Programs</td>
<td>A National Equity Agenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formalized Planning Advisory Boards</td>
<td>Require Equity Assessments</td>
<td>Define and Institutionalize Equitable Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forum for Knowledge Sharing</td>
<td>Improve Regional Collaboration</td>
<td>Formulate Equity Goals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MOVING FORWARD

DEFINING THE GOAL
THANK YOU