Gentrification and Displacement in England and Wales: A Quasi-Experimental Approach

BY
LANCE FREEMAN, PH.D.
Research Question

- Does gentrification cause direct displacement
  - Uses relationship between residential mobility and gentrification as a way of inferring the extent to which gentrification causes displacement.
Motivation

- Several US-based studies fail to find mixed evidence of direct displacement
  - Vigdor 2002
  - Freeman and Braconi 2004, Freeman 2005
  - McKinnish, Walsh et al. 2010
  - Ellen and O'Regan 2011
  - Lee 2014
  - Ding et al. 2015

- Does this pattern hold outside US?
  - US has relatively high mobility rates
    - Poor move frequently—hard to distinguish noise from signal
  - United Kingdom site of much gentrification scholarship
Data

- British Household Panel Survey (BHPS)
  - Nationally representative sample of approximately 5,500 households 1991-2009
  - 2001-2009 waves used in analysis
- Decennial Census 2001-2011
  - England and Wales
Neighborhood

- Lower Layer Super Output Area (LLSOA)
- LLSOAs average 1,500 persons and 650 households
- Created in 2001 to disseminate data
- Because LLSOAs were first created in 2001, the analysis focuses on the 2001-2009 waves of the BHPS, only utilizing data from earlier waves to calculate individuals’ length of residence at their current location.
“Gentry,” National Statistics Socio-economic Classification (NS-SEC) strata:
- Higher managerial and administrative
- Professional occupations
- Large employers and higher managerial and administrative occupations
- Lower managerial, administrative and professional occupations

Consistent with prior definitions of gentry in UK based research (Atkinson 2001)
Two criteria were used to define a LLSOA as gentrifying.

First, in 2001, the LLSOA had to have a representation of gentry that was below the median for all LLSOAs. This is our measure of relative disadvantage.

Second, a LLSOA had to experience an increase in gentrifiers between 2001 and 2011 that was at the 75th percentile or above for all LLSOAs.
Model

- Compare residential turnover in gentrifying neighborhoods to other disadvantaged neighborhoods that did not gentrify
- Control for
  - Life-cycle: Age, marital status, children
  - Gender
  - Citizenship
  - Tenure: Owner, social housing
  - Local housing market: Housing Authority
- Test for interactions for poor, working class, and renters
- Stratify analyses by London metro area
- Estimation approach
  - Hazard model with time-varying covariates
Results: Regression Adjusted Predicted Probabilities of moving

Figure 1. Predicted Probability of Moving

* Statistically significant difference at 95% level of confidence
Figure 2. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Working Class

Author's Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
Figure 3. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Poor by Number of Increase in Gentrifiers
Figure 4. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Working Class by Number of Increase in Gentrifiers

Author's Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
Figure 5. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Owners by Increase in Gentrifiers

Hazard of Moving

Change in Number of Gentrifiers

Author’s Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
Figure 6. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate by Neighborhood Type London

Author's Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
Figure 7. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Working Class London

Author’s Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
Figure 8. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Poor by Number of Increase in Gentrifiers London

Author's Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
Figure 9. Regression Adjusted Hazard Rate for Working Class by Number of Increase in Gentrifiers London

Author's Tabulation of British Household Panel Survey, UK Census Data
But we **know** gentrification leads to displacement

- Explaining the Counterintuitive Results
  - Low income households move/displaced frequently (e.g. *Evicted* by Matthew Desmond)
  - Residential turnover is higher in poor neighborhoods
  - Residents move out of poorer neighborhoods more quickly than other neighborhoods
  - In movers into gentrifying areas likely to be of higher socioeconomic status
Takeaways

- Relationship between displacement, higher mobility and gentrification not very robust
- Gentrification can occur without direct displacement
- Planners and policy makers don’t have to assume gentrification will always displace residents
- *Should focus on limiting disruption and amplifying any benefits*